

ISOJ 2004: Online Journalism in Asia, Europe and Latin America What is different and how does it compare with the U.S.?

*Lorraine Branham, Manuel Gago, Ari Heinonen, Guillermo Franco, Makoto Ota*

---

- **Lorraine Branham**, School of Journalism, UT Austin
- **Manuel Gago**, University of Santiago de Compostela, Spain
- **Ari Heinonen**, University of Tampere, Finland
- **Guillermo Franco**, El Tiempo.com, Colombia
- **Makoto Ota**, The Yomiuri Shimbun ([www.yomiuri.co.jp](http://www.yomiuri.co.jp))Japan

**Manuel Gago:** I'm going to speak about online journalism in a scene. I'm going to make a brief vision over business models demography multimedia development. If you want you can take a copy of the paper print paper after the after the conference okay. We have to understand that this is paying for the internet in Spain inside the big flow of the European Union. So nowadays we have 15 Different countries with very, very comparable sales, so we have 380 million inhabitants and 44% have internet access. You can see many differences between countries. For example, 76% of Swedish people have internet access, but only 15% of Greek people have reasonable, very different levels of access between countries. If we focus on Spain, we can find that Spain has 26% penetration of the internet , so 36% of Spanish people access the internet daily and use the internet as a tool and as an entertainment issue. How Spanish people will populate the Internet. The first thing I have to say is that there is not very much one that is the multilingual multilingual reality of Spain. So median is paying not to publish it in five languages. This makes a complex system of relations between media users, and access in Spanish Galicia, this is my region. Euskera, Basque country and Catalonia and Barcelona and Valencia. The second thing is that most Internet users are male. More than the 58% this is very important. Most of them are short. So 66% of users are between 14 and 35 years. This is the digital divide. So we have many Dzung juicers, many people in Spain connected, but people from 35 years old have really problems connecting and accessing knowledge. So this is a very different use of their data. Most of them aren't middle middle class, middle of high class. Okay. As in Europe, there are quite territorial differences. In access. So there's a correspondence between richness and productivity and the call me call it alive and internet access. So Madrid, the capital, is the region of the capital of Spain. And the core of industrial and politics has the best great internet access 55% Because to a poor region from the inside of Spain, from the the middle of the Spain has the best today the poorest one. So most of the juices on the internet feel like leisure time. But many people also use the internet instead of TV. The Internet is today, real danger for TV broadcasters. So criterions have moved to an internet Okay, focusing on cyber media. We have 900. These are the numbers from last month's 900 Cyber media. As you can imagine, there is a great diversity of formats, productive capacity, languages, and interests. And the audience. How are two journalists that make the most of them are men in the capital? The proportion between men and women is

liberated but in regional peripheral media the proportion of men is highest. So this is a curious data. And the median age of journalists is about 29 years old. If we go back to 1996 These guys were out of the schools and they began to take two to working directly online journals. And there is a very important data. Most of the internet newsrooms has more than 50% of grant holders people with half bad contracts to work and salaries are low. Also. This is not the worst of the panoramas. Okay, if we positioned the media inside the whole traffic of the internet in this pain, fooled worms are the media. So first, Google searchers male media is one marker sport advice, general information under the purview of sport. As you can see, the media has not been the relevant role. of the internet audience. The most important roles are from portals which contain consent right web services like agenda, entertainment in general, the most of the audience of a newspaper, online newspapers are from especially sports. How online journalists catch the revenue, how to make business there are mainly four models. They everything. For example, base shirts, the 90% of content, pay something you can access to work and you must pay to access archives or special reports. Special users don't pay but give us something. You have two left in your email and your data on demography, household income and this kind of thing. Don't pay at all. This is the most online Spanish newspaper. So you can read all the content and this is not any kind of reducer or fees. These are the best internet tutorials. So advertising, traditional advertising banners and these kinds of ads Vogel's continues to be the main economic mainstay. 772 millions of euros, more or less. were invested on the internet. There are other other kinds of revenue business also. So this is eBay's in his printed version. This is the most popular newspaper in Spain. They make a high and top level effort to stay on the internet. They belong to a very very huge communication group with interest in his pain and later in America. So prisa the group created this enterprise which centralizes all digital media of the group. It makes money and information management in a very original way. So the press buys every piece of content and mixes it up and unjoins it to make different projects with all the content of economic media, sports media, general political media, entertainment and so on. They make new brands, new models, new products, and so on in the newsroom of Pisa, which one day is the bias on the net? And the rest of newspapers are outside the newsrooms of the newspapers. There are only very few links inside the newsroom for five journalists and the rest of people, designers, programmers, writers and so on. In other buildings there is no communication. This is the time so the most important thing is that people if you can if you want to access to information in bias, you have to pay annual subscription subscription. They produced all the diaries and it was the first European diary including all the results were not good. We're not good. The other model is to make business in a very traditional way. They sell content and they sell infographics and so on. They are up to obtaining profits by first name this year. This is the section for more than here. Okay. I want to finish this big view with multimedia examples on the internet. As you know, multimedia is famous, the pastiche and the most beautiful face of newspapers so newspapers try to make the best infographics animated multimedia. So I want to show only one kind of word for these kinds of interactive infographics. I love this graphic because it was made by me with TV images with Flash images. It relates to the killer of the information agent office in Baghdad.

Spanish information I didn't have his so it raised a step by step the kill. Okay, this sequential one narrative describes where the killers were, were the office of intelligence. And this is TV images that were pushed inside the graphic and mixed with vectorial ones. So do you have this is a high quality high quality graphics of killing so this was a very brief situation says would you can give all the questions. Thank you.

**Ari Heinonen:** I'm glad to be here for the first time and it is not the last time. Trying to listen to Lorraine is anything between 10 minutes and half an hour. So let's see how I manage this. Well asked me to outline some of the essential features that could characterize the Nordic online journalism scene. It's quite a tall order. But I'll try to meet this by giving in the following some subsets general assets assessments about the situation in our region. But like Manuel, I would like first to give you a rough picture of the region I'm talking about, especially about its communication landscape to give some kind of a context to this online journalism thing. As you see we are up there in the north close to the North Pole in the northern edge of the European Union to the contrary to Spain, which Manuel was describing earlier. We are big countries. There are five Nordic countries and we're big, but only geographically speaking. In all those five countries, there are only 25 million people. And I believe in the US there are at the moment about 300 million people in Finland where I'm coming from there are 5 million people which makes it a slightly smaller media market then I think St Chicago for instance. So it's not that those terms were not big. But also this reflects the size of our media core prices as well. The biggest ones in Nordic countries are Swedish owned Bonaire and finished in Sonoma. WS o y. And their annual turnover in 2002. I believe it was something like 2000 million euros Time Warner's was what it was that I got figured 25 mil 25,000. Millions, something like that anyway, it's a huge difference. Regarding the media landscape, there are three characteristic features in Nordic countries. One is that we are newspaper agents. The circulation of newspapers per 1000 people is highest in the world in Norway. And Finland is in the third position in this respect. And Sweden's fourth second feature is that public service broadcasting is in a very strong position in all Nordic countries. And these companies have also entered the online journalism field in a quite strong way. Third, we are also a new media country. And this refers both to the internet and the use of mobile phones as well as you know Nokia is finished. Well, its headquarters is still in Finland, at least let's say it's on Buy American pension funds, I believe. And we have Sony Ericsson in Sweden. And mobile phone use is very common in all Nordic countries in Finland. Nowadays there are almost more mobile phones than there are people. An important feature regarding new communication technologies is its use, and I believe the word penetration is quite evenly spread among population, at least relatively speaking to the contrary to what Manuel said about Spain, I can say that there are of course differences regarding new media use and penetration in Nordic countries. But in general terms we can say that to a large extent the digital divide is not as wide in the Nordic countries as in some other parts of Europe and the world. Now then, it's no big surprise then I would say that a rich variety of online journalism experiments has grown out of this quite fertile landscape. I will now present three examples of

Nordic online journalism for you to have a taste about online publications in our region. Each of these three cases represent one trend that can be distinguished to my mind in the online journalism landscape in the Nordic countries. Let's take this Norwegian site first. This is where there's God which is the most popular news news site in Norway. It has been praised very many times for its original approach to new media VJ net. It has not been content with only repurposing the contents of its printed version online. But he has deliberately deliberately developed its online character with special features and special contents. It is an ambitious online journalism site, I would say that kind of a site that was envisioned back then in the 90s. For instance in a study that I conducted among those days, new media experts, they envisioned that the future online journalism publications would be making good use of the new communication possibilities, interactive possibilities and multimedia possibilities are enabled by the internet, and especially the World Wide Web, and thanks as they would be distinguishing themselves from traditional media. And to a large extent the internet scam is one of the examples in Nordic countries that is at least trying to proceed towards the race and another example is Helsingin Sanomat on the left, which is run by the biggest newspaper company in Finland. This is an example which I picked here because this is an example of a medium that used to be famous for its innovative and avant garde experiments in online storytelling, but which has recently scaled down its online operations. It really developed its quite unique concept, which produced a series of award winning examples of how online journalism could ideally look like at the moment, Helsingin Sanomat is still doing a rather nice online publication. Nothing wrong with that, with numerous special sections and special features, services, but its news content is basically repurposed. From the printed version. I think housing and cinema in this sense, regardless of its very nice features, pretty much represents a typical newspaper approach to online journalism that can be found in Nordic countries. I was hesitant in the beginning. Then we've actually painted after a while, and then it has been slowing down again, since the investments didn't pay back immediately. The third example here is dance Goradia, the Danish radio, Denmark radio I believe, which is an example of the strong online presence of public broadcasting companies online. We have some similar examples in Finland as well in Norway. In Sweden as well. And it seems to be to me regarding online journalism staying in Nordic countries, but also these public service broadcasting corporations are also nowadays very much stressed financially so to say but since they are not being dependent, so directly on advertising revenues, they have been able to develop with more purpose for me if I would say some introducing new features of CRS online journalism is of course that they are by nature able to produce genuine multimedia content because of their expertise in in video and audio fields. And in addition to that, their production cycle has always been more or less 24 hours a day, seven days a week instead of newspapers, bubbler once a day publishing cycle. So this is the first trend of online journalism in Nordic countries which I would like to raise here, and that is that the scene is rich. online journalism is alive and doing relatively well. And it has established its role as a matter of fact dimension of the news media. The second trend, which is to my mind dominating discussion of online journalism in the Nordic countries is no surprise it's money. I haven't noticed that. Well, to me, it seems that

the media industry at the moment is almost desperately trying to find out how to make money with online journalism and fast. I noticed that this quest for revenues dominates all the meetings and conferences of media executives. So much so and this is something that I've been starting to think that rather than speaking of the public, or even having the audience in these meetings, the dominant terminology. terminology is saturated with phrases like customer or sometimes consumer and this may be rhetorical hairsplitting, but to me, this reflects that. Journalism is seen as something that is to be sold at the Public Interest side of journalism, which anyway is the basis of how business if you will, is seldom present in this industry, this course. To put this section short, I just say that, in this quest for revenues, there are the typical things being discussed in Nordic countries as everywhere I think. Media companies are trying to get money from advertising and from content and as, as everywhere and to certain extent advertising scenery. Doesn't look too bad. In the whole of Europe, there is a forecast that online advertising will grow by 15% this year. And last year, banner advertising in Sweden cut up by 17% and whole online advertising was up 14% in Finland. So these are quite good figures, I believe. But then we have to remember that online advertising is only 2% of the whole advertising cake in Finland. So we are still speaking about relatively small amounts of revenues and contents, selling condensates. It's about selling subscriptions as the sale price has been helping Astana Martez is now charging for its online contents. But it is also about multiple content, revenue strategy strategies. Some many newspapers are selling their PDF papers, they are selling the mobile news and they are selling their access to their archives. And this is well if money is the second trend. The third trend is then related to this multiple revenue strategy or strategies of online media in Finland. To put it very briefly, it seems to me that while online journalism online me online journalism media is trying to figure out how to get revenues from all kinds of sources. This has led to a phenomenon, which can be called multiple media publishing. No news in that either. But to me, I'm a bit worried about this present stage of multiple media publishing. Because to me, it seems to be, I would say that online journalism has, to a certain extent, read used to mean only recycling of journalistic bulk material in many Nordic online media. There is online news, there is mobile news, there are PDF papers, but all contain the same material. So what we get for subscription fees is more of the same. And I'm not sure whether that is a feasible strategy, not from the point of journalism, at least, isn't to my mind. And I'm not convinced that it is either a very feasible, business tragic strategy in the long run. So I will cut it here now instead of this half an hour. Want to emphasize this, that, that this multiple media and journalism is to a certain extent beneficial for the public? We are living in a multiple media device environment already, so it's very nice to get news. From different channels. But if it means that we only get more of the same, I'm not sure whether it will be a feasible strategy for online journalists. Thank you.

**Lorraine Branham:** Thank you professor, the editor of El tiempo.com to talk about online journalism in Colombia and Latin America.

**Gago:** *(inaudible)* predictions covering the election elections in Spanish in online media are covered in a huge way. So, there is very, very little to do with online real time statistics undisputed very, very few to special reports. So most of most of elections were covered using internet media and accessing to real times but in the in the last month in March, we have the general on the Spanish elections after the march attack, so, the case was, was very, very intensive because people were trying to access to read multiple media sources from the web. So web blog, blogging. alternative sources were just to try and find try to find not official information on on the on the elections and bombing All were mixed in these days.

**Audience Member:** You talked about shift and language from audience to consumers. Are you seeing that with the public television or public media sites as well?

**Audience Member:** The question here is whether or not there was a shift in life were you seeing this change in television as well as well, on the television and into public media,

**Heinonen:** Well, I would say that these discussions which are referred to I was needed, meaning the in-depth pre meetings, and also public service, broadcasting, financial and financial directors and whatever they are, they speak very much about the same thing. And so I think that this quest for revenues has over arching present presence there. The moment of course, it's different with service broadcasting operations because they, to my mind, can to a certain extent, plan their operations. In a longer period than then every three months. As is the case in many cases, even him in private media, but I mean, it's there's also

**Audience Member:** I was wondering whether or not with public support for TV and broadcasting whether or not there are any complaints from the commercial operations about the fact that taxpayers are helping to fund their competition? Yes

**Heinonen:** This is not only a Nordic phenomenon. I think that you're aware that in previous encryption, the discussion has been quite intense about how much the BBC internet should compete, and it should be allowed to compete with private online media. Because it's a public process and cooperation. And the BBC is, to my mind, terrific. Good online journalism, and it's doing mostly this one on taxpayers money, but to me, it doesn't matter. I get very good journalism online from BBC AI from wireless to that matter. Question in the European Union, the European Union's. Finland is one of the most eager members of the European Union. Norway's not a member of the European Union, but regarding union, new media policy, so the presence of the so - called commissioner of the European Commission is finished, Mr. Escalade, and they have very strong policies about enforcing new mirrors, the spirit and industry of new communications technology in Europe. There are official policies and they are enforcing them

quite strongly to encourage European industry to compete better with us communications technology in that trend, Japanese as well. And also about the spreading of digital literacy among the population in the European Union.

**Gago:** What I say it's also true, so only the information technology policies of the GOP in general have been stressed in the last 10 years to donate a lot of money to private investment, protected level and also to create other levels of content, entertainment content on the web, and the results I know exactly. If it was successful or not. Responses and many many products from the web were supported by the public investment, European Union.

**Branham:** Could you repeat the question into the microphone for the internet audience? I think she'll line us actually to shorter format to presentation

**Gago:** Good question. Yes. Yes. She asked her how digital media was competing with broadcast media. What is different in online media to compete with traditional ones? More or less? Interest in the media. If you see, I have curated for 40 years in India internet media. Huge killer from the end, from 6pm to 12pm. So this is the time from prime times in Spain to the most important time in broadcast news. 10pm For Israel now, well our way of life, so this time is the most of internet volume. of many, many, many monitors. What's most important is that the quality of the free television is not paid televisions is really worse. Really worse. So many people are saying in surveys that they use the internet because they know nothing on TV. So you know, this is a very easy competition. Difference between print newspapers and multimedia, online newspapers. There are two main bases and subbases of value. Added value in online media. One of them is a multimedia infographic. Some value on how you use archives are the 30% of volumes of the online media. So many people use archives as knowledge, strategy taking of decisions inside their business and inside politics and so on. So if you have a very good archive system in your online media and So many people use archives as knowledge, strategy, taking decisions inside their business and inside politics and so on. So if you have a very good archive system in your online media and you have a spectacular visual, animated infographics dribble will take lots of holdings in the space.

**Audience Member:** I was wondering as internet journalism or journalism evolves in your countries, or do you feel that you're developing specific national models or regional models in Europe? And also, is there any reluctance or feeling that decisions that you make might seem too Americanized?

**Heinonen:** That's an interesting question, but I think journalism is not trading to that. In that sense. Technologically dependent. I mean, there is, I suppose that we can say that there is more

or less a universal model of journalism at the moment, online and offline. We don't yet when we see it in India, India or in Spain, or in Finland and the United States. So, in that sense, I don't think that there's a national model of online journalism in, for instance, in Finland, but then then again, it's an interesting question this a student of mine is doing his doctoral thesis about how much how local online sites have regional newspapers in Finland and his hypothesis at the moment he's only begun it is that not much but but he's a professional journalist. At the same time, his desire is that they should be local to the global net. And so to put a preface, there was much more room for local if you will, national features in online journalism, also in offline journalism.

**Gago:** Yes, it's also a very interesting question. I agree with Ari. So you can find I think the main differences are the investment capacity of the media and creating things for the web. But if you place me in a medium position, everybody, I want to make archives. I want to make news related. I want to make forums and these kinds of things. So I think most European media. Medium sized, online journalists are really very similar and the business model is only very similar. Most of the brands for example, today, we just had dinner, we speak about our arts. For example, on this day, classified ads do not exist in online media. But in the US it is very important. Business model. I think it depends on the traditional media culture of every country, but there are just little peaks in England real globalization. Just talking about the local or national features of online journalism, I think there are many innovations to be found in this respect. I'll just tell you about one one little experiment that we did in connection with one of our online, online communication, local online communication, experimental projects and it was called neighborhood correspondence. So we have an online publication, published in Tampa by our research team, but we trained ordinary people from neighborhoods to do some basic reporting from their immediate environment, about their neighborhoods, about their blocks. What happened there, and it came out that this is for one. It's mostly interesting to those people who are engaged in that then they are not professional journalists, but they have the basic skills to produce stories and pictures. And the other thing is that their output, the journalism that they're doing is most interesting. I mean, it's not something that our local newspaper would print because they always have so little space on their news on their site, pages and so on. But it's important to those people who live in those neighborhoods. And I think this might be one one way to make use of this. These features that are allowed or enabled by new media.

**Branham:** Stop with the questions for now and we'll get back to the presentation and we'll have more time for questions later.

**Makoto Ota:** Everybody, and thank you for taking your time. troubleshooting, and I'm Makoto Ota from the Yomiuri Shimbun in Japan. I'm a staff writer there and initially I intended to cover the symposium as a writer. I sent an email asking for some of the points on this symposium to

Professor hours but he kindly offered me an opportunity to present. I was very surprised. Actually, I was annoyed because I was tough right? Who covers the pool? To summon something but not to be scared skim now. I'm trying my best to present some outlines to help you grasp what's going on in Japan. So for your understanding, Japan has 127 million people, just about half of the United States, right? And five major newspapers or national papers and many other regional papers. And Japan's subscription rate per household is 1.7 which means each household subscribes to more than one paper. So that's why Japanese people are sold. News TV and home delivery rates are very high. 93.9% And we have two editions on weekdays, morning and evening. Morning. Why is this here every day yesterday and in the evening? We have another paper here on the same thing. Japan has 70 million internet users and the penetration rate is at one point. And others you can see in the chat are in the graph. Broadband by ADSL is very common in Japan. Many people know Japan has medium cellphone users, of which 68 are mobile internet users. So nowadays many people use cell phones not just to talk to other kinds of tiny Ethernet gadgets. Mobile phones have huge functions such as Java enabled data, memory consorts, barcode reader, infrared data access mp3 player and global positioning system with navigation and documents Excel or PDF file reader and it is expected that we will have a very near future with ICT or digital TV receiver and beyond. So the mobile phone is very popular among Japanese, especially among young people. So our Yomiuri symbol is a glove founded in 1884. Is 1/30 anniversary this year, actually in November, and it publishes a 10 million copies are they the largest paper in the world, actually, and it is in comparison with woffinden past times Scargo to review and the times in London to figure or we are exchanging article news articles each other among such such papers, and numbers of TV stations, and our phone is orchestra and the most professional baseball team that Yomiuri giants and so on. As you can see, from top to bottom, it is very uncommon. And also, we can read from left to right here, as you can see so definitely is wrong. It is very flexible, and very, very 3d. And we have English daily, daily Yomiuri independent and so in terms of online present presentation how can I get online Oh yeah. Which says the United States should not change it for sovereignty or something, and we have categorized the news, international and domestic issues and support also. And we have so many features like money and housing. It deals with automobiles, women's jobs or entertainment books or why or pictures and these are old books, so it was launched in June 1995, one year before. The New York Times runs its website and it has 200 million pageviews and unique views are 5 million and 3 million in the office. And our advertisement revenue in fiscal year 2003 was \$7.6 million dollars 15% More than the previous year. So, we have news and features such as jobs, houses and women also. And we also have that website in a cell phone system using HT Nemo. Record a to Kaitai in Japanese and which means mobile phone or cell phone. So the service was introduced by NTT Docomo frosting in February 1999. And among eight immune cell phone use of fixed 8 million subscribers to cater the internet. Company fees and use and ringtone melody and photos email update for this month. We have 300,000 subscribers for two services paying \$2 monthly and 7 million annually. So this is our website. This is very different from the ordinary website but by HTML, and this is the Yomiuri Giants professional basketball

team. And it has so many uses here. He has news or pictures of each player and we have updates for the games here or databases are on here. And I would like to explain how your work works. We update continuously. Our news articles whenever we have new sayings and see we're broke. And we created a distribution center in March 2000. enabled which enables us to publish articles online on a 24/7 basis. We have some articles in the newspapers and online and some articles purchased for features such as women or automobiles. And we report some kind of news and send it to the senior reporter called the captain and they send their edited article to editors who are distribution centers and editors choosing articles to put on paper and distribution centers are snatching those kinds of articles from the editor and to put on the website on their own decision. And such entities are going to the proofreading department for two factor checking or Gramma collecting or something like that. So then, those articles are getting back to the editor and the distribution centers and the editors. Those articles on paper and distribution centers put on no website or cell phone or extreme cyber and so on. So, the Japanese market has huge competition. In recent days. But our main competitors other papers such as Asahi or mine e.g. Nikkei, but not so much with Yahoo News in Japan, because they don't come up here. So because this is Yahoo News in Japan, there's so many headlines over there and we have to buy the article to Yahoo News. Here's our news. Yahoo Japan has a lot of news in Japan because our Yahoo News gathers so much traffic, maybe 200 million pageviews per day. So it is not our competitor because of very differences between ours and this so it is almost the end of my presentation. As my colleague said, our program is a minute long. We almost entirely depend on advertisement revenue, but it is a very small portion of advertisement marketing in Japan so we don't have much money now. So we are in the writing department. We are called the blood reading department. We are making shoes lead in this is why Yomiuri ONi is trying to make other revenue from other revenue sources such as sharing articles to try to push harder on fairpoint internet. So another program for us is in Japan. Thank you.